Can civilians contribute to education? The impact of non governmental organizations in value education

Levent ERASLAN,1 Erdi ERDOĞAN2* and Yunus HAYRAN3

1Associate Professor Levent ERASLAN, Kirikkale University, Faculty of Education. 
2Research Assistant. Erdi ERDOĞAN, Kirikkale University, Faculty of Education. 
3Research Assistant. Yunus HAYRAN, Kirikkale University, Faculty of Education.

Abstract

The concept of value can be defined as relative behavior patterns which are idealized by individuals within the context of their own philosophies and various factors (religion, culture, history) in the society. Especially, values have significant role in shaping societies by providing human rights based environments and preventing conflicts in daily life. Societies which transfer proper national and international values to individuals, live in peace. In the context of social benefit, NGOs also can contribute to value education process. In general, the concept of civil society is an area between public and private area or at their intersection created on a voluntary basis by the citizens who have rights and responsibilities in the fields other than the family, the state, the market and the politics in order to solve their problems and protect their rights. This area, which is pluralistic, autonomous, and participative and includes civil activities, relations and interests, ensures that their demands are met by means of various embodiments. Peoples who participate in these organizations, can contribute to different sections of society. One of these sections is education. NGOs have also a significant duty to represent the needs and values of the society within the context of their basic philosophy. NGOs are based on social values with this mission and values are transferred or changed through or by NGOs at the same time. This study is first to examine value education process through an analysis on the concept of value. Then, the roles and functions of NGOs will be discussed in the context of national and international examples in value education.

Keywords: Values, Value Education, Civil Society, Non-Governmental Organization

INTRODUCTION

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) maintain its importance in 21st century. NGOs which strengthen right’s demands and peaceful society structure of persons, is effective in the fields like protecting of environment, providing human rights, supporting educational process etc. In particular, after Rousseau, Locke and Hegel who indicated the differentiation between public area and private area, NGOs has increased its importance (Eraslan, 2011a). NGOs contribute to daily life by bringing together individuals,
expressing different ideas for solving problems and reflecting collective conscious nowadays.

When we consider the NGOs’ functions indicated above, we can say that NGOs will play crucial role in shaping educational processes and educational experiences. In this context, NGOs will influence value education process which became popular subject area in recent years. Value education process is formed by state based approaches and deficiencies are ignored. Besides, state can’t give enough support to value education process and this process become different according to existing political power’s ideology. Thus, continuity can’t be provided. All problems stated above cause unsuccessful value education process.

In this regard, NGO’s will be effective in solving of problems owing to express different opinions, prepare training materials, contribute to educational planning and collaboration. In addition to this, NGO’s will provide interiorising of values (Akin and Özdemir, 2009). Thus, NGO’s contributions will fill the deficiencies of state. Due to this reason, the main aim of this research is specifying of NGOs’ roles in value education process. This study will first examine the various definitions and characteristics of value concept and then discuss the roles of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) with exemplary practices.

**Value Concept**

The concept of value is one of the hard-to-define terms of social sciences. The concept of value is described by different disciplines of social sciences based on their own characteristics. These definitions are indicators of the fact that the said concept is a rich and widely-used one. It is possible to talk about the conceptualization of the term value in various fields such philosophy, economy, sociology, psychology and theology. It is this rich background of the concept which makes it one of the hard-to-define terms because each field of science defines it within its own framework. However value concept has a capability to amalgamate the seemingly-different concerns of all fields of science dealing with human behaviour.

Philosophy, through its axiological conceptualization, regards values as problems. It examines values through questions such as "what is good", "what is beautiful" and "what is virtue". In addition, it considers values to be part of ethics, aesthetics and political philosophy. In sociology, value concept refers to the significance of objects and conscience phenomena for class and humankind (Hançerlioğlu, 1986). Moreover, the effect of the values created by what is sociological on individual behaviours is another subject of sociological studies. In other words, sociology deals with "value problems". Many classical sociologists such as Durkheim, Weber and Marx studied on the effect of values on the society (Marshall, 2012). As for psychology, value concept is analysed within the context of the individual’s needs (eating, drinking, sexuality, need for acceptance, respectability and love) whereas individuals’ preferences are analysed in terms of value. Bearing this in mind, it may be said that conceptualization of the term value in psychology is different from the conceptualization in sociology in that psychology rather considers the individual’s own needs and thoughts as values while sociology analyses the effect of strong values created by the society on the individual.

The concept of value etymologically refers to the following in different languages: "Valor" in Latin; "valore" in Italian, "valeur" in French; "value" in English; "wert" in German, and "valor" in Spanish; and thus the basic meaning of the term is "being precious" or "being strong". In Turkish, the term is described as the “superior and beneficial quality”.

Following this analysis on the concept of value, it would be useful to mention various definitions of the concept.

According to Marshall (2012), the term value has several meanings that are completely different. It shows individuals’ opinions about what is right or wrong; or what is preferable or not in terms of ethical or appropriate behaviours. For Doğan (2012), the concept of value is the manner of existence or action which is accepted by an individual or by a community as ideal. As for Macions (2012), values are culturally constructed standards, which also constitute the guidelines for social life, used by people to decide over what is appealing, beautiful and good, which also constitute the guidelines for social life.

The term value refers to the generalized fundamental principles or beliefs that are accepted by the majority of the members of society as true and necessary for the sustainment and maintenance of their own existence, unity, operation and continuance; and that reflect their shared feelings, thoughts, aims and interests (Kızılçelik and Erjem, 1994). Bolay (2007) defined value as “figure which people think valuable, run after to reach and desire to get”. For Fichter (2004), values are the criteria that give meaning to culture and society. Values either disappear in time or they survive for years passing down next generations in parallel with individuals’ tendency to protect or ignore them. This phenomenon depends on the acceptance and internalisation of values. Values cannot certainly tell individuals what to do; however, they guide them to find what is right or not (Gudmundsdottir, 1991). Values can be classified in different ways. It is possible to make several classifications such as material-spiritual values, universal-local values, new-old values, religious-national values and rural-urban values using various comprehensive frameworks to define the value types.

Let us try to make a definition of the term value in the light of the definitions given above: “Value refers to integrative statements of the society that are generated
and idealized by individuals within the context of their own life philosophy and various factors operative in society (religion, culture and history) which may be relative and binding”.

The major idea, which is obvious and agreed by many in the consequence of all these discussions, is that values are vital for people. Expanding this judgment a little, it may be said that values exist for the benefit of individuals and the individual exist through his/her values.

The major characteristics of the concept of value may be summarized as follows:

- Values are beliefs; however, these beliefs are not objective and remote thoughts but beliefs that are an integral part of feelings.
- Values constitute a motivational structure. They help individuals with attaining their desired ends.
- Values are beyond certain actions and circumstances. They are abstract goals. Their abstract nature in general distinguishes them from other concepts such as norms and attitudes which help with special situations, actions and goals.
- Values provide guidance in the selection or evaluation of actions, policies, people and events; in other words, they serve as standards or criteria.
- The priority of values varies from person to person. The priorities of an individual characterize him/her as a person. This hierarchical nature of values also distinguishes them from norms and attitudes.

To sum up, values are shared; most people agree upon the values. They do not depend on the judgment of a single individual. They are taken seriously; individuals regard them as a part of the total attempts aimed at protection of welfare and satisfaction of social needs. Values co-exist with passion; individuals sacrifice, fight and even die for exalted values. Finally, may be conceptually alienated from other valuable objects in that they require inter-personal consensus and compromise (Fichter, 2004).

Value Education

Values are abstract concepts upon which the members of society in general agree and teach each other. This quality leads to a problem in ensuring the maintenance of them. The formal dimension of value education is maintained by training and school concepts whereas its informal dimension is sustained by family and environment which are rather of an implicit nature. Thus, it may be concluded that value education or value teaching is the main duty of both the state and the society.

Values have a familial and environmental dimension and value education in that dimension is rather provided by social learning and imitation. The formal education which is provided by the state is based on teaching and this is in fact what the parents primarily expect. This expectation is embodied in the following statement: “The state should teach the values of the society in schools”. This judgment shows that value education should mean not only the cognitive transfer of basic knowledge and skills in certain places and times but it should also be related with gaining individuals values as behaviours. Within this framework, as also noted by many beginning with Socrates, the purpose of educating a virtuous individual in education reveals itself as “being good person”, “straightforwardness”, “complying with ethical rules”, “being respectful” and “valuing the individual and the environment”. This process can only be actualised by education programmes and teachers’ practices because education has to make all individuals well-equipped in physical, cognitive, intellectual, emotional and spiritual respects.

Value education strengthens students’ self-confidence, their positive thinking and their capacity to assume their personal responsibilities. Students thereby gain experience in practising their ethical thoughts and social responsibilities. Value education is considered not only from a local perspective but also from a wider perspective due to globalization. A society may transfer not only local values but also universal values that are accepted by the world to individuals. Various universal values such as human rights, democracy, freedom, equality, rights, love, peace, respect, tolerance, forgiveness, cohabitation and opposing violence should also be taught both by the family and environment and in schools. These universal values are irrevocable; in the absence of any of them the society cannot survive and individuals forget humanity.

Value education includes helping students with their selection of value (Naylor and Diem, 1987). It emphasizes the citizenship training and ethical education in practice whereas it underlines today character training which also covers psychological, ethical, social and cultural development in terms of virtue and attitudes and in personal respect (Halstead and Taylor, 1996). Value education aims at the transfer of values via ethical environment and programmes in schools. In addition, it deals with the development of the values of students and it gives an idea about what values are necessary for them (Veugelers, 2000). Value education is a multi-dimensional combination of education and ethics. When literature in value education is explored, approaches to
this subject may be categorized into three. These are (i) direct value education; (ii) reason-based value education; and (iii) holistic value education, which is based on the culture in which individuals live (Halstead ve Taylor, 1996).

Value education is a process which is strongly emphasized by education systems around the world. In advanced education systems, value education is provided in Ethics, Character Education, Citizenship Education, Democracy Education and various disciplines of social sciences. In our country, in primary schools, values are integrated into the curriculum of compulsory and selective courses such as Social Studies, Social Sciences, Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy, Law and Justice, Environment and Science, Folk Culture, Media Literacy, Reasoning Education, Kur'an, and Life of Mohammad and Basic Ecclesiastical Information in accordance with the course’s characteristics. Similarly, in secondary schools, values are included in the curriculum of compulsory and selective courses such as Democracy and Human Rights, Religious Culture and Ethics, History, History of Turkish Revolution and Kemalism, Philosophy, Sociology, Aesthetics, Kur’an, and Life of Mohammad and Basic Ecclesiastical Information.

When the history of value education is considered, a consensus on the necessity to integrate values into education and training system is reached. However, a little consensus is reached about what to teach and how to teach. This subject, in which different experts are involved, has turned into a very complicated discussion. In the meantime, today’s pluralist common values have been introduced into modern education. Those who oppose this system either exclude or criticise it. To understand how to integrate value systems into complicated environments, it is necessary to evaluate value criteria in their peculiar school cultures and to take part in organizations which study on what kinds of strategies and practices to be used (Harris, 1991).

Then, is the state or the society alone satisfactory in teaching values? New questions about this subject have only recently been asked in academic studies such as: Are the values which the state wants to impose compatible with those of the society? What are the qualities of value education provided through informal processes in communal living? Non-governmental organizations may be considered to be one of the components that would help the state with value education processes.

Non-governmental Organizations in Value Education

The most significant practice of modern civil society interpretation is individuals’ ability to create civilian initiatives through voluntary, organized and transparent relationships. Modern civil society understanding underlines the organization of civilian initiatives. “Conflicting social structures resulting from modernity have led to the need of different interest groups in society to suppress political decision-making mechanisms and thus the institutionalization of NGOs”. NGOs have become one of the essentials of modern and organized life as a result of the fact that democracy had become operative in societies with all its institutions and rules. NGOs have a vital role in creating and sustaining the deliberative democracy (sometimes more than the state and the government) through the contributions of organized citizens to their country’s social and economic welfare and the order of civil society. European Economic and Social Committee (EESC) regards “all organizational structures that assume responsibility for the benefit of the society and that serve as intermediaries between the official authorities and citizens” as NGOs (URL 1). With this quality, NGOs are as effective and strategic as family, environment and the state in the protection and development of social values. NGOs, in social union practice, are comprised of independent individuals who coalesce to advocate an ideal or a belief or to realize something that is non-profitable. This composition is based on the values which are accepted by individuals by free will (Ryfman, 2006). Similarly individuals may prefer to be involved in certain groups that represent their own interests, identity and values in civil society. For this reason, individuals create interest groups in order to cope with controlling activities and resources which are of social value; “civil society is described as an active citizenship that is integrated into the culture and policy of a society. The key unit of effect and change in this definition is neither the government nor an institution. It is the individual who acts alone or collectively to strengthen the society. Thus, what individuals think of and advocate about themselves and the values they implement constitute the fundamental characteristics of civil society (Whitley, 1999, cited Teegen, Dohand Vachani, 2004).

The primary philosophy of NGOs is to be the representatives of the needs and the values of the society. With this mission, NGOs are based upon social values and these values in return are transferred or changed through NGOs. In other words, “Each NGO is based on a value”. For instance, human rights and democracy is a common motive among the NGOs around the world. Along with NGOs which were established for universal values such as peace, independence and equality, there are NGOs related with environment and nature and those which are associated with religious and familial values. Labour and solidarity are values. Labour unions have been established to protect these values. Cooperation and being sharing are values. To that end, foundations have been established in both East and West. Thus, all these may lead one to the motto “Civil society is a value itself”.

In analyses on the transfer, protection and regeneration
of values, NGOs are found to have a significant role in the creation of values (Hildy, 2004). For instance, Whitley (1999) defines NGOs as collective actors with certain social tendencies which attempt to produce social values. In the absence of social integrity in important services, NGOs are critical in governance and value production. Berger and Neuhaus (1977) indicate to the fact that NGOs are central to traditional and universal value production as institutions reflecting social issues whereas Simmons (1998) notes that “NGOs can ensure social welfare through value production”. Gray (2002) says that NGOs are in a kind of interaction with the state in the global world and value production and indicates to a significant partnership in that sense. This partnership is schematized in Figure 1.

Value education is such a significant process that it cannot be depended merely upon the state and family. Transfer of values to individual can only be accomplished through a partnership between state-family and civil society as also reflected in the diagram above. Relying merely upon family and environment during this process may lead to transfer of undesired behaviours under the guise of values to individuals. Such an unplanned value education that would be realized in an informal environment is hard to turn into a positive, permanent and meaningful behavioural change. Providing individuals with value education only through teachers in schools based on the formal education determined by the state may not also give the desired result. In addition, the necessity of a student to observe the value behaviour in his/her environment and reinforce it together with his/her family should be remembered.

The problem related with the permanence and internalization of those values transferred in schools through courses included in the education programs is another question of debate. Teachers’ inefficiency in special education methods and techniques aimed at value education and above all their inability to be a role model for their students indicates to the necessity for a third mechanism to intervene in the process. NGOs not only support or supplement to the two actors mentioned above in value education but they are also in a position and of a nature that would provide control. In the following part, the roles to be assumed by NGOs in value education will be discussed.

Roles of NGOs in Value Education

NGOs in Turkey have become increasingly influential on education policies since 1990s. The functional advantages of NGOs have a big share in this increase. Furthermore, NGOs’ expertise in a specific field, their profound knowledge and mobilized nature contrasted with central management and bureaucracy may be listed as other factors. NGOs’ close relationship with the environment in which the problems exist makes the sustainable solutions possible. Within this context, NGOs may have active roles in value education. These roles are analysed in three main fields in Figure 2.

I. EXPERTISE SUPPORT

NGOs are supported by various experts in their field both on voluntary and professional bases. This support is a significant power of NGOs and it functionally constitutes an influence area. NGOs’ expertise support in value education at this point can be evaluated in four areas. These areas are handled in Figure 3.

A) Preparing Education Program

Education program is a guide included in training and education programs covering the purpose, content, education status and processes such as assessment and evaluation of a discipline (a course). Within this context, course books and all kinds of education programs are regulated in accordance with these education programs and they are of strategic significance in education process. Three main groups take part in the preparation of education programs. The highest committee is program decision coordination committee. The second committee is program working committee. The third one is program counsel committee. It provides the program working committee with counselling when necessary. In accordance with this operation procedure, NGOs may take an active part in each phase of program development. Experts of value-based NGOs may contribute to the development of education programs. This contribution may be made both during the development and the evaluation processes. For instance, Turkish Foundation for Education Volunteers (TEGV), Child Rights Education Project, Democracy Education and School Councils Project, and Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education Project took an active part in the review of course books and programs. History Foundation, to that end, also realized its “Human Rights in Primary Course Books Project”. The said foundation, which is motivated by the necessity to “improve the course books and the program with an end to educate peaceful and creative generations that respect various beliefs, cultures and identities”, have reviewed the course books used in primary and secondary schools in terms of form, content and pedagogic methods. Within this scope, the related books, primarily Primary School Citizenship and Human Rights Education Course Book, have been evaluated. The foundation completed its first review in 2004 and collaborated with NGOs along with other institutions during this process. Turkish Academy of Sciences and Turkish Foundation for Human Rights,
Open Society Institute and European Union are only some of those institutions and unions which have supported the above-mentioned project of History Foundation.

B) Preparing Education Material

Education materials are auxiliaries used during the education process to ensure a permanent and meaningful learning. Developing materials in value education and using these materials in education processes are together is a hard process because developing concrete materials aimed at teaching values in an affective field requires a significant expertise. Within this context, the Turkish National Ministry of Education has recently started to benefit from NGOs’ expertise in material development through signing protocols on cooperation. For example, for “Diabetes Education in Schools Program” commenced in 2011, it signed a partnership protocol with Child Endocrinology and Diabetes Association. In addition, Mother-Child Education Program has been implemented under the umbrella of

---

1The related diagram was prepared by the related researchers based on the related literature.
Figure 3. NGOs’ Expertise Support in Value Education

Preparation of Teacher Education Material

Preparing Education Program

Preparation of Teacher Education Program

Developing Policy

Expertise Support

Foundation for Mother Child Education (ACEV) in cooperation with the Ministry of National Education. Cooperation is established in activities aimed at child rights with Child Foundation; in activities aimed at the education of gifted children with Turkish Foundation for Gifted Children; in activities concerning vocational courses or development and adaptation courses with ELGINKAN Foundation. In addition to these, “Teachers have no limits” was established for teachers’ vocational development in collaboration with Foundation for Teachers’ Education; “Vocational High School is a National Issue” was established for the enhancement of vocational education in cooperation with Koç Foundation; and finally “Autism Education Kit” was established for children who are in need of special education in collaboration with Tohum Autism Foundation (Eraslan, 2011a).

One of the education materials prepared by NGOs in value education is the “Colourful Game” prepared by Community Volunteers Foundation (TOG). The Colourful Game, also known as the democracy game, is an enjoyable and funny game which was created during the activities of Community Volunteers Foundation within the scope of its “Democracy and Our Rights” Project in 2006. In this game, everybody is both a loser and a winner. It was started to be played in 25 separate primary schools as a pilot scheme by the Ministry of National Education. Through the play, individuals are made to understand the fact that “issues related with them are most of the time related with others”.

Some NGOs cooperate for value education. For example, “Pink Frog Theatre” staged the play titled “King of the Forest” for the first time in 2007 for those children at the ages between 3 and 12. Children are also involved in this play and the theme is the necessity of individuals to decide after thinking and to not allow others to deceive them. In addition, advantages of democracy are reflected in the play through a poetic language. Since 2007, the performance of the play has continued in every year. This play was planned to attract the attention of primary school students primarily in cooperation with the Ministry of National Education and its subordinate bodies. Plays of Pink Frog Theatre have the nature of a course and they last for the period of a class. Children may thereby spend a 40-minute time of a class both learning and entertaining. Some primary schools take their student to these plays calling it an extracurricular activity. NGOs such as Ana-Çev, Kemalist Thought Association, Çosev Shçek Atatürk Nursery Volunteers, Turkish Education Volunteers Foundation, Losev, Serebral Palsili Children’s Association supported this activity.

C) Teachers’ Education

Teacher is a vital element in value education. Teachers have a critical role in value education with both their knowledge and behaviours because students should see values reflected in the behaviours of their teacher; who is a role model for them. Raths, Harmin and Simon (1978) in their Values and Teaching, explain the significance of teachers as follows:

“Teachers should avoid adopting any attitude which would make critical thinking on issues related with values difficult for students. Teacher should invite his/her students to reveal their values, should listen to them with great care and patience, should not judge them and should not direct them through explaining his/her own thought. He/she should be kind to students and should share their happiness and sorrow. Teacher may thereby create a frame of mind that would encourage the students”.

Activities of NGOs concerning teachers aimed at value
education are on-the-job training, focus meetings, informative seminars and meetings, support activities and education material support. One of NGOs which provide active support for teachers in value education is Umuts (Hope) Foundation. The foundation organized seminars on democratic citizenship education for teachers who are invited from 81 provinces in collaboration with the Board of Education and Discipline based on the fact that educating well-equipped and qualified teachers in the fields of Democracy, Human Rights and Citizenship Education is essential. Instructors of Umuts Foundation with successful accomplishments also took part in the seminars.

D) Developing Policy

Developing efficient policies is a must to integrate values into the education system and make them handled in an efficient manner. Within this context, activities such as determination of the values, deciding in which processes and in what manner they would be included and generating the execution areas can only be conducted through developing policies on value education. For this reason, NGOs provide significant support for decision-makers in value education. This process is not limited to support but it may extend to monitoring, control and advice. For instance, TEGV is an important reference for those who will develop policies on value education with its project called “We are Citizens and Participants”. It is an education program aimed at contributing to the education of children and the youth in such a way to make them “modern, purified from clichés, prejudices, discrimination and violence individuals and citizens who are aware of their rights and who are capable of critical thinking especially about social issues”. The target group of “We are Citizens and Participants” practice is children who are at 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 5th, 6th, 7th, and 8th grades. The program which spans half a year includes titles such as individual-society relationship, child rights, gender, media, reconciliation and participation. In addition, it covers a project on these titles prepared by children.

“Child Rights Raising Consciousness Project”, which started in 1992 and has continued up to the present, is an important Project of YORET Foundation. Within the scope of the project, various panels, conferences and seminars on child rights are organized and continuing education seminars particularly for those who work in the fields related with children (teachers, psychological counsellor, psychologist, police, and social services) are organized. The project aims to increase activities directed towards the implementation of United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child and to ensure that children could use their rights without discrimination.

As a result of the Peace Culture and Education Workshop of the 21st Century Education and Culture Foundation (YEKUV) in collaboration with Bogaziçi University Peace Education Implementation and Research Centre (BEUAM) and Humanist Bureau, “Peace Culture and Education” is recommended to be included into the curriculum of the education programs of primary and secondary schools as a selective course and all education system is suggested to be enhanced in accordance with the principles of peace culture based on the fact that peace is a kind of behaviour that should be attained in early childhood.

II. DYNAMIC ORGANIZATIONAL SUPPORT

Non-governmental organizations are shaped by the dynamics operating in a society and values provide individuals with an opportunity to cooperate with others (Pharr, 2003). In a state, citizenship is compulsory but non-governmental organizations work on a voluntary basis. Individuals need common thoughts, needs and reasons for being together. Individuals choose to be a member of different groups which represent their interests and identity in a civil society. For this reason, individuals constitute interest groups to manage the resources and activities of social value (Whitley, 1999). Those individuals who take part in joint actions try to reach goals that are not attainable on their own. The reason for the emergence of this composition is NGOs’ rapid and mobilized nature. With this quality, NGOs most of the time can take action and they can develop policies and practices concerning the issue in a communication network which is more rapid than that of the state mechanisms. This dynamic organizational structure of NGOs may also be used efficiently in value education. If we consider value education in four areas, these areas may be as follows (Figure 4):

- Value Introduction and Agenda Development Efforts
- Monitoring, Assessment and Control Efforts
- Capacity to Produce Alternatives
- Advocacy Practice

- Value Introduction and Agenda Development Efforts

NGOs may have an active part in value introduction and agenda development efforts. A NGO, which is an organized mechanism of social life, has several advantages as a composition both in the fields of value introduction and agenda development. NGOs are effective actors in value introduction with their direct relationship with the community and through its means such as relations with visual and written media, means for developing agenda and giving direct information to the
public, meetings, seminars, conferences, brochures, magazines, books and reports. For instance, in campaigns for education of girls that have been conducted by AÇEV for years, education is handled as a value. NGOs in the field of education such as TEGV, TOG, TOÇEV, Gık-Yar work for the introduction and proliferation of education as a value in terms of human rights (Eraslan, 2011a).

Value Education Centre (DEM) adopts and recommends an understanding of education which values and attaches great importance to the role of values in human life around the world regardless of the place of residence and considers it necessary to improve this understanding. It is an institution which intends to conduct theoretical and practical studies on "values and value education"; to organize project-based and workshop-based education activities; to provide support for those who want to conduct academic studies in this field; to be a centre collecting the information and data obtained on this subject; and to serve as a point of contact for those researchers abroad in order to serve for the above-mentioned purpose.

A) Monitoring, Assessment and Control Efforts

Another duty of NGOs covers monitoring, assessment and control efforts. A NGO is not a place for leisure activities established merely for the needs of a certain segment of a society. Neither is it one of the assistants of the state. NGOs are serious monitoring and control mechanisms. With this characteristic, NGOs are of an opposing nature and they monitor and control all activities of decision-makers. False or deficient practices of the state, if any, in value education, are determined and announced to the public by NGOs. Particularly, the quality of the content used in basic value education in course books, examples, subjects and practices are under the control of NGOs. The purpose of this control is to make value education more qualified and to ensure its permanence. For instance, "The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women" was included in the education program of Citizenship and Democracy Course through the lobbying works of History Foundation and Ka-Der. This implementation was suspended by the Minister of National Education Ömer Dinçer in 2011 and NGOs protested this suspension. Efforts of History Foundation to remove all gender-based, nationalist and religious statements from education programs and course books with its project called "The Role of Education as a Social Reconciliation Means" have been continuing for years. Most of the recommendations made by History Foundation such as removal of National Security Course from the program, reformation of History of Turkish Revolution and Kemalism Course as Modern Turkish History in a way to cover the social, economic and political history of the Republic of Turkey more comprehensively and establishment of a civilian monitoring group or platform concerning the course books were published under the title of "Recommendations Report" in 2010.

B) Capacity to Develop Alternatives

NGOs are structure that has a capacity to produce alternatives along with all their functions mentioned above in that they are comprised of individuals with different qualities and they do not have a strict vertical structure as opposed to public bureaucracy. These alternatives may be in the form of policies (thoughts and strategies) or of practices (activities). This is also a result of the colourful and creative qualities of the members of NGOs who unite on a voluntary basis. This quality reveals itself through projects conducted by NGOs.
“Artist Education Project” and “Values and Value Education Project”, which are supported by education unions and are among the articles related with value education that were agreed upon during the 18th National Education Council are alternative thoughts and they are implemented in education process. “March of the Silent Shoes” which was created by Umut Foundation for the benefit of “Peace and Reconciliation” value and has been conducted on the 28th of September of every year is an alternative. “Human Rights Roof” which was created by TOG for the benefit of human rights is an alternative practice.1 “Tiny TEMA” (Minik TEMA), “Baby TEMA” (Yavru TEMA), “Young TEMA” (Genç TEMA) and “Graduate TEMA” (Mezun TEMA) projects which were produced by TEMA for the benefit of nature and environment values was intended to teach and spread these values.

C) Advocacy Practice

Advocacy practice is one of the most significant characteristics of NGOs. This practice is the attempt of NGOs to influence any public policy for a common interest. It may also be described as a process of using knowledge strategically in such a way to change the laws or policies in favour of those who are excluded from the society through influencing the decision-makers. Advocacy also aims to demand changes in the laws or policies or to contribute to the changes in them. NGOs may practice advocacy through campaigns or lobbying activities concerning values. Many NGOs practice advocacy about values such as nature and environment as in Hydroelectric Power Plants (HPPs), human rights and democracy, protection and enhancement of women's rights, education, constitutional rights and freedoms and the protection of labour value in working life.

III. PARTNERSHIP (COOPERATION) SUPPORT

NGOs and the Ministry of National Education may establish various partnerships through cooperation

1 The continuing Democracy and Our Rights Education Programs within TOG are comprised of The Youth and Social Rights Education Programs, Social Rights Coffee House and Living Library. Social Rights Coffee House is a typical coffee house whereas “Life is Hard!” aims to make individual think on human rights and discuss them through the box game and its players. The coffee house established during the festivals in universities aims to make the young discuss issues related themselves such as health, accommodation, education, employment and poverty – through an innovative means while drinking their tea or coffee. (www.tog.org.tr)

practices both in central organization and in schools. This partnership is examined in five areas in Figure 5.

A) School and NGO Cooperation Capacity for Value Education

As also reflected above, NGOs may establish cooperation through practices and policy development in value education. This cooperation may be established for school, teacher, student and the program. Within this context, the important thing is how to establish cooperation and how parties would position themselves. The biggest complaint made by NGOs is the fact that the Ministry of National Education regards them as assistant components and involve them in the process only when necessary.2 For example, in “Value Education Project” NGOs are not mentioned. Even though cooperation is emphasized in the Ministry of National Education Primary and Secondary Education Institutions Social Activities Regulations, from time to time ideological attitudes of local decision-makers may be influential.

B) Sharing NGO Opportunities

NGOs’ staff of experts, rapid communication networks, their means for introduction, advertisement and taking initiative, their material support, their national and international ties and their written tools such as books, magazines and brochures may be regarded as opportunities in value education. Perhaps, the most important thing is that opportunities are created not as a duty but on a voluntary basis and they are shared.

C) Written and Visual Media Introduction Support

NGOs’ projects are accepted and supported by media. Particularly those projects which are produced for the

---

2 Provision of student and parents cooperation with public, private non-governmental organizations in activities, Project proposals may be referred to the surrounding NGOs, third persons or other institutions and organizations for their contribution. Social service related activities are included to educate students in such a way to make them individuals who are sensitive to their family, environment and the society; who have a consciousness to work on a voluntary basis; who solve problems and provide solutions; who have developed their skills to work in collaboration with public, private non-governmental organizations. Provision of support for the efforts of NGOs established for the purpose of social service (Ministry of National Education Primary and Secondary Education Institutions Social Activities Regulations, 13.1.2005).
benefit of public are introduced and supported. For instance, campaigns such as “Father, send me to school” (Baba Beni Okula Gonder), “Snowdrop” (Kardelen) and “Star Class” (Yıldızlar Sınıfı) may be listed as examples to this situation. Social media and communication networks emerging from opportunities provided by internet have become increasingly popular. NGOs increase their members and their thought and service capacity through internet. The fact that access to internet-based social networks is relatively easy and the fact that legal and bureaucratic oppression is at a low level make the participation easier. This way, activities are rapidly massificated. Particularly the participation of the young in the activities of civil society in the virtual platform increases. This effective communication network may be supported for value education. Introductory films, short clips, informative videos may be broadcast both in television and on the internet through NGOs. These may be delivered to thousands of people in the blink of an eye.

E) Project Development and Implementation Support

Recently, particularly EU funds, support provided by Development Agencies, SODES practice of the Ministry of Development, Project support of various public institutions and projects supported by local governments have been increasing remarkably. NGOs may provide expertise during the evaluation of compliance of the project prepared for value education to the criteria used for project development and they may also partners to that project. Many value-based projects are accepted and supported by the above-mentioned resources. NGO, as an element accelerating this process, is one of the partnerships to which great importance should be attached.

RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Value as a difficult conceptualization is a significant concept which has an influence on both social life and on personal processes and to which an immense importance is attached. The significance of the concept is reflected in social life; individuals unite for common values and act in accordance with these values. Values leave a mark on individuals’ lives varying from clothes, greeting and daily rituals to the way of speech. This care about values has naturally led to value education process. Both society and decision-makers have made efforts and have developed policies for the transfer of and for teaching values. In education echelons from pre-school education to higher education, values are included in courses as subjects whereas families and environment transfer them to individuals in an informal manner. This study has discussed the possibility of the inclusion of a third party to
value education. This third party is NGOs. NGOs may provide support for value education in the form of (i) expertise; (ii) dynamic organizational support and (iii) partnership (cooperation) support. To that end, these three areas have been examined through dividing them into various sub-areas and the statements presented have been supported by several examples.

Value education should be provided not merely by the state or by the society naturally but also through NGOs' cooperation and support. The fact that civil society is a value itself also facilitates this. The necessity of decision-makers who always complain about the fact that old values have been eroded and replaced by the new ones to regard NGOs not as secondary assistants but as primary partners is the final statement of this study.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The concept of value should be provided as a separate course rather than providing it as a subject during classes in each echelon of education. The Ministry of National Education should integrate a course called “Value Education” into the programs of primary and secondary schools.
2. Necessary regulations should be made to ensure the cooperation between NGOs and the Board of Education and Discipline in the preparation of education programs for courses related with values and in the preparation of education materials concerning values. A kind of cooperation not aimed at counsel but aimed at contribution should be established.
3. NGOs seem to be more willing to contribute to value education than the Ministry of National Education however they are disturbed by excessively controlling attitude of the Ministry of National Education and by being regarded as merely supporting elements. The Ministry of National Education should involve NGOs in the process in deficient areas. For instance, there is not any cooperation with NGOs in Value Education Project in works to be done and in partnerships. Ministry should renounce this attitude.
4. A cooperation protocol between the Ministry of National Education and NGOs in the field of value education should be prepared. NGO-school value education projects should be financially supported.
5. Challenging bureaucratic procedures to be followed by NGOs for their activity planning and implementation processes should be reduced.
6. NGOs should be given active roles in the preparation of education programs, in National Education Councils and in teachers’ training.
7. “Civil Society and NGO” subjects should be added to the course programs of primary and secondary schools to make the society understand the concept of civil society and NGOs and to increase social consciousness.
8. NGO reports on value education should be taken into consideration by decision-makers.
9. Policies aimed at the development of civil society in value education and at increasing support of local governments (governorate, district governorate and special provincial administration) and municipalities for NGOs should be developed; legal regulations should be made and practices encouraging cooperation and principles should be developed to that end.
10. The Ministry of National Education and NGOs should establish an active cooperation in values related with nature and environment. In researches it is observed that only planting trees cannot establish values. Policies aimed at developing universal values along with local values should be developed.
11. The institutions and organizations which provide financial support for projects should be directed towards giving priority to value-based projects.

ABBREVIATIONS

AÇEV - Foundation for Mother-Child Education
BEUAM - Boğaziçi University Peace Education
DEM - Value Education Centre
EESC - European Economic and Social Committee
NGOs - Non Governmental Organizations
SODES - Social Support Programme
TEGV - Turkish Foundation for Education Volunteers
TEMA - The Turkish Foundation for Combating Soil Erosion for Reforestation and The Protection of Natural Habitats
TOÇEV - Tüvana Willing to Study Child Education Centre
TOG - Community Volunteers Foundation
YEKÜV - 21st Century Education and Culture Foundation

REFERENCES

Pratikleri (TOÇEV Örneği)”. VI. Uluslararası STK'lar Kongresi, Çanakkale, (Turkey, 23-25 Ekim 2009)
Simmons, P. J. 1998. “Learning to live with NGOs". Foreign Policy, 112.

**İnternet References**